

Village of Skaneateles
Historical Landmarks Preservation Commission
June 19, 2013

Present: Chad Rogers, Chairman, HLPC
Dave Birchenough, Member
Katherine Dyson, Member
Ted Kinder, Member
Lisa Riordan, Member

Dennis Dundon, Clerk to the Historical Commission

Robert Eggleston, Architect, on behalf of the Applicant

At 7:30 pm Chairman Rogers opened the Public Hearing in the matter of the application of Michael Worden for replacement of windows at 20 East Genesee Street. Mr. Worden introduced himself as the owner of the building that houses Hairtique on the street level. He noted that, "In the past it was Talbot's Five and Dime. Just basically replacing the 4 replacement windows that are 35 to 40 years old. What will be going in will look identical – double-hung, no gridwork, white – they will look identical. If it were done on Monday, if you were to go by on Tuesday, you wouldn't even know anything was done. It is just very, very straightforward. Did anyone have any questions?"

Chairman Rogers, "Just a clarification before I ask the Board for questions. There are existing storm windows outside of the..." Mr. Worden, "No. There are no storm windows. It's just a single pane of glass. And that's one of the things that this will help me with; it will make it more energy efficient plus it will give me some noise deadening properties. And another thing that will make it very nice for me – they will be tilt-in so I can clean them instead of getting up on the ladder and cleaning them from the outside. It will make it much safer and I'll be able to do it on a monthly basis instead of 2 or 3 times a year." Chairman Rogers asked, "Questions? Comments?"

Member Birchenough asked, "Are the windows vinyl windows now?" Mr. Worden, "They are about 75 or 80 percent now. The casing, the sill, it's all vinyl, vinyl-clad. The only wood is the wooden frame that makes up the sash. Other than that it's already all vinyl. As I say they are replacement windows that are in there already. Bill Talbot did it back around '75 to '80 back in that period. So they are all of 35, close to 40 years old at this point." Member Dyson asked, "Did you look into wooden – you are in the Historic District and normally vinyl is not an acceptable material." Mr. Worden, "Even though it's vinyl already?" Member Dyson, "Yes, when you are trying to correct something that somebody did that wasn't correct way back. So my question is did you look into wooden, all wood? They have some pretty good ones that have the same attributes." Mr. Worden, "No. they were already vinyl so I didn't think it would be necessary. And I know that many of the other property owners up and down the street have

vinyl or vinyl-clad windows already. As I say these are already 75 – 80% vinyl. I didn't think there would be a need for it."

Member Kinder said, "Vinyl windows in an Historic District are really – there are really only a couple of materials that are really *verboden*, so to speak. Vinyl is one of them, unfortunately. It's unfortunate because you really can't tell unless you get up fairly close to them. But they weather a little differently over the years." Chairman Rogers said, "I would concur with what Ted said. I think, unfortunately although they already are, at some point they were changed to that – to vinyl/wood." Mr. Worden, "Mr. Talbot did it and I understand he made the renovations back in the mid-to-late '70s. As I say a number of other property owners in the district have put vinyl windows in, so I just didn't understand that there would be a need for it." Member Riordan said, "This Board is pro wood windows. We are pretty pro wood." Mr. Worden, "I understand. I just don't understand why the other people didn't have to do it." Chairman Rogers said, "Unfortunately it wasn't us five sitting here." Member Dyson said, "It may have pre-dated the Historic District." Mr. Worden, "These have all been done within the last 5, 10, 15 years. I know in the last 5 years at least two people have gone back and had their windows – had vinyl cladding put on. On the ground level, I can understand why it might be a requirement, but on the second, third floor up, I don't think anyone would even know the difference. It's going to be white, the dimensions are all going to be the same. Some of the windows along the way are metal. They are not wood. Especially some of the new construction."

Chairman Rogers said, "Unfortunately we are in the position of representing what the Board and what the Village thinks will be appropriate in the Historic District; that's our responsibility now. So, from my standpoint, and I don't know about the rest of the Board, I can't vote to approve a vinyl window." Member Kinder, "Bob, the Pella windows we put in the Lakeview House, they are a wood window but they are clad on the outside and wood on the inside." Mr. Eggleston said, "They are aluminum clad."

Chairman Rogers opened the public comment portion of the hearing. Mr. Eggleston said, "Bob Eggleston. I am not intimately familiar with what Mike has proposed, but I am hearing what he is saying. My experience, having worked maybe 25 or 30 years with the Historic Commission has been that the Skaneateles Historic Commission has found the aluminum clad wood windows to be quite acceptable. Working with Pella, Marvin, a couple of those, they have actually gone out of their way to make the profiles historic in nature, the grills – I know you are not proposing grills – in fact when we did the Creamery, they were identical to the windows coming out. We replaced those – the size, the profile. So they actually do a very nice job. And this is a relatively commodity product; it is not Gepetto making a window for that particular building; it is off the assembly line. They are reasonably priced. They are wood windows, aluminum clad, that carry a very traditional styling. I think it is also important to look at – the original windows had a brick mold around them. You can get that brick mold trim. When I redid the Trolley Building, not being in the Historic District but holding myself to those standards, I purposely put a brick mold profile around the windows to duplicate the windows that we had taken out – that were 100 years old and really in tough shape and not salvageable. I know that other Historic Districts, you go into Syracuse and they do not accept aluminum clad – it has to be wood windows. I find that burdensome, because now you have to maintain them and you are talking three stories high. I have over the years found this Board to be reasonably accommodating in allowing an aluminum

clad wood window as an acceptable substitution. They are tilt-in. You can get airport zone quality for sound deadening and those qualities. So not speaking pro or against, I just add that opinion.”

Member Kinder said, “It would be interesting to see if there is a picture of this building before these latest windows were installed.” Mr. Worden, “I have no reference.” Member Riordan, “May I ask a question about the lintel; the board below the window on the second and third floor? It’s the sill. Is that stone?” Mr. Worden, “There are 2 that are stone and 2 that are wood. Two are like a granite material, two are wood.” Member Riordan, “The two that are wood are not in perfect condition.” Mr. Worden, “No, I’ve got to get up there and get them stabilized. I’ve been having some trouble with the building next to mine with the water coming off – the gutters have been clogged. And I have been fighting the problem with the building to the east of me; that’s required my immediate attention both in the front and the back of the building. That’s certainly on my list.”

Member Dyson, “It looks like the gutter comes down just above.” Mr. Worden, “It’s a whole story higher than mine, every time it clogs the gutter it overflows and it is cascaded on the front. It’s been a fight for 3 years to maintain the front of the building, because the water just runs down it. I have recently started to have the same problem in the back of the building – when a strong south wind comes and it is raining, it’s like a garden hose is going off the back of the building with the cedar shakes and the soffit area has taken a heck of a beating. Last week I just finished repainting and brining that back up to snuff.”

Member Dyson, “So would you be replacing the wood with brick or stone?” Mr. Worden, “Oh no, just painted. I’m going to scrape that, treat it, prime it and then repaint it the same color of paint. I think I can get an oil-based paint that will stand up to the weathering a lot better than a latex.”

Chairman Rogers said, “Since we don’t have any other members of the public, I will close the public portion of the hearing. Can I get a motion to close the Public Hearing?” **Member Kinder moved to close the Public Hearing. Member Birchenough seconded the motion.** Upon the unanimous vote of the members present in favor of the motion, the Public Hearing was closed. Chairman Rogers asked, “Is there any further discussion from the Board?”

Member Kinder asked, “I take it you’ve got a price from these guys?” Mr. Worden, “About \$2700 or \$2800. They are almost 6 feet in height, so the size is going to be a factor.” Member Kinder said, “That’s actually a big vinyl window. I think these people make a pretty good window; it may cost a little more for a Pella or Marvin, but you are going to get a better window, to be honest.” Mr. Worden, “What about Meyer’s at the top of the hill? I understand they do very good work also.” Member Kinder said, “Yeah.” Member Riordan said, “He would work with different companies than Pella or Marvin, though.”

Chairman Rogers said, “My recommendation is that we continue this matter, assuming that there are not 3 of us who are going to approve the vinyl, is that accurate?” So could I have a motion to continue...” Member Dyson said, “I think we ought to also to be fair to you – would be in line with the aluminum wood that you described. Is that something that would be acceptable?”

Member Riordan said, "There may be different profiles of the aluminum it may defeat the purpose..." Member Dyson, "I think a little guidance to be helpful." Member Kinder, "This is a pretty standard double-hung window." Mr. Worden, "They are Anderson. I even tried getting the parts that need replacing and doing it individually, but they just don't make them any more." Member Riordan asked, "Do we have an opinion on tinting or argon windows? Have we discussed that at different Board meetings?" Member Kinder said, "Not while I was on the Board. But in general, we don't want any heavy tinting. Like that low-e that gives you that greenish; none of that." Mr. Worden noted that he had stapled information to the brochure stating that the blue color was just photo background. The proposed windows are clear glass.

Member Kinder said, I think we would be hard pressed to deny aluminum clad windows because there are a lot of them on the street already, that have been done in the last 4 or 5 years. Member Birchenough said, "I just can't go with the vinyl. I have to go for wood, and if we have so many aluminum clad ones that have gone in in the last few years, then I guess they are allowed too. I think we have to allow them." Member Dyson said, "I would like to see you do, is to come back with what is available in wood, without going off the charts in expense. See if there is a window in wood that has the same things you are looking for." Mr. Worden, "One of the biggest problems and it is the problem that has forced me to stand here tonight, is the maintenance." Member Dyson said, "I think you can find one that would work. We are forming, and we are trying to come up with a set of standards before you get to this point." Mr. Worden, "What about the casement and sill and such. I won't be able to get to those and paint and maintain them." Opinions were offered about the ability to do that with tilt-in double hung windows.

Chairman Rogers said, "So what is our preference?" Member Dyson said, "It would be wood." Member Riordan said, "I agree. I think a wood window is definitely preferable and if you find an aluminum clad window, I would like to see a brochure of it." Mr. Worden enquired about makers and was told that both Pella and Marvin are good. He indicated that he would also check with Meyer. He asked about when the next meeting was. The Board indicated its willingness to meet on the subject ahead of its next regularly scheduled meeting. **Chairman Rogers said, "I move that we continue this application submitted by Michael Worden in order to allow him to submit revised materials to July 17, 2013 at 7:30 pm unless an earlier meeting is arranged." Member Riordan seconded this motion.** Upon the unanimous vote of the members present in favor of the motion, the matter was continued.

This matter was concluded at 7:54 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Dennis Dundon
Clerk to the Historical Landmarks Preservation Commission