

Village of Skaneateles
Historical Landmarks Preservation Commission
October 10, 2012

Present: Patricia Blackler, Chairman, HLPC
Katharine Dyson, Member
Ted Kinder, Member
Karlene Miller, Member
Dave Neibert, Member
Andrew Ramsgard, Member
Mona Smalley, Member
Beverly White, Member
Carol Young, Member

Dennis Dundon, Clerk to the Historical Commission

Mark Ditch, Applicant

James Lanning, Village Trustee
Chad Rogers, Skaneateles
Doug Sutherland, Skaneateles, Village Planning Board
Bob Eggleston, Skaneateles

At 7:29 pm Chairman Blackler opened the Public Hearing in the matter of Mark Ditch's application to replace ground floor windows for 96 East Genesee Street. Mr. Ditch introduced himself as Building & Grounds Chairman for St. James Episcopal Church and made the presentation, saying, "We want to, primarily for the reason of making it more energy efficient, replace the single-pane windows that are down around the first floor of the Church. There are 4 on this [west] side and 3 along the driveway as you go into the parish hall. They are actually semi-subterranean; they are actually in a window well on the driveway side. We'd like to just take them out and replace the sashes themselves with double-pane windows. I tried to give you an idea. I took a picture of the window and I realized I should have probably tried to find some kind of floor plan so you understood where those windows were. Thinking that it was an esthetic concern, I wanted to show what one of the sample windows look like and then provide catalog cuts of what we are replacing them with. They are the same style, double-hung window; the primary difference is the fact that they won't be true divided-light window, there will be a simulated division between the panes that adheres to the outside of the window. Quite frankly I went and looked at the ones over at the Chestnut Cottage, over across the road, to make sure that they were going to be acceptable to the Church and to myself. Unless I got up very, very close, I couldn't really tell the difference."

Chairman Blackler asked, "Now these are four paned. Does that mean you are not going to use the six-over-one here?" Mr. Ditch clarified, "That's primarily a catalog cut. It's going to be the same." Member Ramsgard said, "So you're going to match the same pattern." Mr. Ditch said, "So really it's divided two ways; that's the top and that's the bottom sash." Member Young said, "I just have a comment. It seems to me that in an historic district it is better to repair than to replace. Different companies make special windows that can go on the inside and act as a storm window, where you are still maintaining the separateness of the mullion that you're talking about, and the old wood frame and the old glass." Member Dyson asked, "What is there; is there anything worthwhile saving in these?" Mr. Ditch said, "No." Chairman Blackler said, "They are in pretty bad shape." Mr. Ditch said, "It's energy efficiency but it's also that they are beginning to deteriorate. And what we are trying to do is avoid regular maintenance." Member Young said, "I have had windows like that and I think that if you have a good painter, they can fill it in; if it is not too bad it can be repaired." Mr. Ditch, "Unfortunately it's beyond..." Member Ramsgard said, "Marvin is a great product line. They specialize; they have a whole division just for historical restoration. I have used them extensively on many projects and the SDL, which is what is specialized here for the light pattern, is really the right choice. Sometimes in historical restoration, you have to make the choice of materials and energy efficiency. In my opinion, matching the light pattern is the most important thing. It is still a double-hung window. On our lake we have extreme weather conditions and a clad product is the right choice. That is what this is. Marvin's profiles for this particular product very, very closely match the original. I think it's a good choice." Member Neibert said, "To me, as long as the appearance is the same, that's the number 1 thing. As long as it looks the same from the outside." Mr. Ditch, "That's what we were aiming for." Member Ramsgard, "Marvin's colors have more than just that one option. They have an ice gray, I forget the name of it, but it is almost exactly the same color."

Member Kinder asked, "Have you priced the true divided-light – and it's really just one divide we are talking about here? Does Marvin have the capability of doing a custom window like that?" Mr. Ditch, "They do, and they run about another 30% more expensive." Member Young said, "But it can be worth it." Member Ramsgard said, "I don't know, I still disagree. What happens in the true divided light with insulated sash, the size of the light rail becomes huge because you have two flanges that you have to have holding the glass in. So even though it is theoretically 4 panes, it doesn't have the slim look that a glazed-in, puttied-in window has." Mr. Ditch, "It's going to be the same width as the existing divisions that are there." Member Kinder, "Will it be internal to the glass or will it be applied to the outside?" Mr. Ditch, "It is applied to the outside. Actually both sides." Member Ramsgard said, "It says both sides. And it has a spacer bar inside it, so you can't look from the side through the grids." Member Young asked, "Have you priced having them repaired? And having the storms applied?" Mr. Ditch, "I did not. To be a good steward, I don't want to resign from building & grounds, and have somebody have to turn around and refinish them again. We are trying to make the right decision for now and for the future." Member Dyson said, "And these are along the side in any case, so they are not... You're going to keep the stained glass windows." Member Ramsgard said, "If it was the stained glass windows I'd have a totally different opinion." Mr. Ditch said, "That's next. I'll be before you again when we get ready to restore those. But that will be a restore." [Multiple simultaneous conversations, including the color]

Mr. Ditch said, "There is the original there that I think probably does a better representation than the photocopy." Member Neibert asked, "So these windows are actually on the west side?" Chairman Blackler said, "No; they are on both sides." Member Neibert said, "They are not really visible from the street. They are as you are walking up the park, but from a distance."

Chairman Blackler closed the public hearing. **Member Ramsgard said, "I would make a motion to declare this application complete and that we accept the replacement of the 7 windows at the ground level, to be replaced with Marvin windows in an SDL divided light that's permanently affixed to both sides of the glass with the spacer bar, and that is consistent with the scale of the original windows and that it is appropriate for providing for today's energy concerns." Member Miller said, "I'll second the motion."**

Chairman Blackler called for the vote. Affirmative votes were cast by members Blackler, Dyson, Kinder, Miller, Neibert, Ramsgard, Smalley and White. Member Young cast a negative vote. Chairman Blackler called the motion passed.

Mr. Ditch thanked the Commission. This matter was concluded at 7:44 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Dennis Dundon, Clerk to HLPC